MINUTES TRANSYLVANIA COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MAY 12, 2025 – REGULAR MEETING

The Board of Commissioners of Transylvania County met in a regular meeting on Monday, May 12, 2025, at 4:00 p.m. in the Multipurpose Chambers at the County Administration Building, located at 101 S. Broad Street, Brevard, NC.

Commissioners present were Larry Chapman, Chairman Jason Chappell, Vice-Chairman Jake Dalton, Teresa McCall, and Chase McKelvey. County Manager Jaime Laughter and Clerk to the Board Trisha Hogan were also present. County Attorney Bill Bulfer participated remotely via Zoom meeting software.

There were approximately 30 people in the audience.

Media: Laura Denon - The Transylvania Times

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Jason Chappell presiding declared a quorum was present and called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

WELCOME

Chairman Chappell welcomed everyone to the meeting and introduced the Commissioners and staff in attendance.

PUBLIC COMMENT

The comments represent the speakers' opinions or points of view.

David Whitmire: Mr. Whitmire thanked County Manager Jaime Laughter and Emergency Management Director Kevin Shook for their leadership in the Hurricane Helene recovery efforts along the French Broad River. He then addressed the Board regarding the section of the French Broad River upstream from Rosman to the Island Ford access point. Speaking as a business owner, the Town of Rosman representative on the Transylvania Natural Resources Council, and a longtime river advocate, Mr. Whitmire emphasized that this section of the river is part of the state-designated French Broad Paddle Trail and serves multiple users. He expressed concern over a recent pause in debris removal which he believes delayed the removal of critical blockages and posed a risk to public safety. Mr. Whitmire noted that Headwaters Outfitters had suspended river trips past the Green River takeout due to impassable conditions downstream. He submitted photographs to demonstrate that the remaining ³/₄ mile could have been completed had the six-day pause not occurred. He called for the Board of Commissioners to advocate against further pauses until at least the removal of major blockages is completed. Mr. Whitmire concluded by emphasizing that the restoration efforts involve more than debris removal—they are essential for public safety, recreational access, and environmental stewardship.

<u>Hannah Bowers</u>: Ms. Bowers shared that she recently gave a presentation to the City Council and wished to share the same information with the Board of Commissioners. She expressed concern about the impact of rising property assessments, particularly on long-term residents in historically lower-income neighborhoods. To explore potential disparities, Ms. Bowers conducted a small sample study, selecting 20 properties in the Rosenwald neighborhood and 20 in the East French Broad area (including Franklin Street and Parkview). She focused on properties that had not changed ownership in recent years and compared assessed property values from 2014 to the present. Her findings indicated that, over the last 10 years, assessed values increased by

210% in Rosenwald and 169% in East French Broad. While acknowledging the small sample size, she referenced other research suggesting that current assessment practices may be disproportionately shifting the property tax burden onto lower-income and historically Black neighborhoods. Ms. Bowers emphasized that the concern lies with the assessment system so she urged the Board to consider whether the system is flawed and to explore what actions can be taken to prevent the displacement of longtime residents. If left unaddressed, she was concerned that the issue could expand beyond neighborhoods like Rosenwald to others, such as Rosman.

<u>Bruce Gleasman</u>: Mr. Gleasman addressed the Board regarding concerns over Transylvania County's property tax rate. He referenced a comparison of tax rates among surrounding counties, noting that Transylvania County's current rate is among the highest in the region. He cited other counties, such as Henderson, Haywood, and Jackson, with lower tax rates, and questioned why Transylvania's rate remains higher despite a similar population size to some of these counties. He expressed concern that the tax rate could increase further with upcoming expenses, including the construction of a new courthouse. He pointed out that while the County's tax rate has remained the same over the past five years, overall spending has increased by millions of dollars. Mr. Gleasman questioned the sources of increased revenue, whether it came from new development, state or federal government funding, or other sources such as profits from services like the DMV. Mr. Gleasman advocated for budget reductions rather than tax increases, suggesting that the County could lower its tax rate by reducing its budget using strategies such as consolidating operations and reducing the County's physical footprint. He concluded by urging the Board to seek economic development opportunities through advocacy at the state level.

AGENDA MODIFICATIONS

There were no agenda modifications.

Commissioner Chapman moved to approve the agenda as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Dalton, and unanimously approved.

CONSENT AGENDA

Commissioner McCall moved to approve the Consent Agenda as submitted, seconded by Commissioner McKelvey, and unanimously approved.

The Board approved the following:

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The Board approved the minutes of the April 28, 2025, regular meeting.

RESOLUTION ALLOWING RETIRING OFFICER TO PURCHASE SERVICE HANDGUN

The Board adopted a resolution authorizing retiring Sheriff's Office employee Bobby Scott Thomas to purchase his service handgun for \$1.00, as permitted under N.C.G.S. § 20-187.2. Mr. Thomas retired effective December 1, 2024, after 18 years of service. Sheriff Owenby submitted the request.

RESOLUTION # 20-2025 ALLOWING RETIRING OFFICER TO PURCHASE SERVICE HANDGUN

WHEREAS, NC General Statute § 20-187.2 provides that the governing body of a local law enforcement agency may, in its discretion, award to a retiring member the service handgun of the retiring member; and

WHEREAS, Bobby Scott Thomas is an employee of the Transylvania County Sheriff's Office where he has served as a School Resource Officer at Rosman Elementary and in 2018 was promoted to School Resource Sergeant assigned to Rosman Middle School; and

WHEREAS, Bobby Scott Thomas has been employed by the Transylvania County Sheriff's Office since May 26, 2006, and retired from service effective December 1, 2024, with 18 years of service;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Transylvania County Board of Commissioners to allow Bobby Scott Thomas to purchase his service handgun in accordance with the provisions of NC General Statute § 20-187.2 for the purchase price of \$1.00.

This the 12th day of May 2025.

S://Jason R. Chappell, Chairman Transylvania County Board of Commissioners

PROCLAMATION - NATIONAL POLICE WEEK

The Board approved a proclamation declaring May 11–17, 2025, as National Police Week, with Peace Officers Memorial Day observed on May 15. This annual proclamation honors the service and sacrifice of law enforcement officers locally and nationwide. Copies will be presented to the Transylvania County Sheriff's Office and the Brevard Police Department.

PROCLAMATION #21-2025 NATIONAL POLICE WEEK

WHEREAS, in 1963, the Congress and President of the United States designated May 15 as Peace Officers' Memorial Day, and the week in which May 15 falls as National Police Week; and

WHEREAS, there are approximately 800,000 law enforcement officers serving across the United States, including the dedicated members of the Transylvania County Sheriff's Office and Brevard Police Department; and

WHEREAS, the members of the Transylvania County Sheriff's Office and Brevard Police Department play an essential role in safeguarding the rights and freedoms of our community; and

WHEREAS, it is important that all citizens know and understand the duties, responsibilities, and sacrifices of their law enforcement agencies, and that officers of the Transylvania County Sheriff's Office and Brevard Police Department recognize their duty to serve the people by safeguarding life and property, by protecting them against violence and disorder, and by protecting the innocent against deception and the weak against oppression; and

WHEREAS, the men and women of law enforcement unceasingly provide a vital public service who by their faithful and loyal devotion to their responsibilities have rendered a dedicated service to this community and in so doing, have established for themselves an enviable and enduring reputation for preserving the rights and security of all citizens;

NOW, THEREFORE, the Transylvania County Board of Commissioners proclaims the week of May 11 – 17, 2025 as Police Week and calls upon all citizens and all patriotic, civic, and educational organizations to observe May 15, 2025, as Peace Officers' Memorial Day in which people may join in commemorating law enforcement officers, past and present, who have made the ultimate sacrifice in service to their community or have become disabled in the performance of their duty.

This the 12th day of May 2025.

S://Jason R. Chappell, Chairman Transylvania County Board of Commissioners

PROCLAMATION - EMS WEEK

The Board approved a proclamation designating May 18–24, 2025, as Emergency Medical Services Week in Transylvania County. EMS Week honors the dedication and lifesaving service of both paid and volunteer EMS personnel. The 2025 theme is *We Care. For Everyone.* The Board expressed pride in the vital role EMS staff play in serving the County's residents and visitors.

PROCLAMATION #22-2025 EMS WEEK

WHEREAS, emergency medical services is a vital public service; and

WHEREAS, the members of emergency medical services teams are ready to provide lifesaving care to those in need 24 hours a day, seven days a week; and

WHEREAS, access to quality emergency care dramatically improves the survival and recovery rate of those who experience sudden illness or injury; and

WHEREAS, emergency medical services fills healthcare gaps by providing important, out-of-hospital care, including preventative medicine, follow-up care, and access to telemedicine; and

WHEREAS, the emergency medical services system consists of first responders, emergency medical technicians, paramedics, emergency medical dispatchers, firefighters, police officers, educators, administrators, pre-hospital nurses, emergency nurses, emergency physicians, trained members of the public, and other out of hospital medical care providers; and

WHEREAS, the members of emergency medical services teams, whether career or volunteer, engage in thousands of hours of specialized training and continuing education to enhance their lifesaving skills; and

WHEREAS, it is appropriate to recognize the value and the accomplishments of emergency medical services providers by designating the Emergency Medical Services Week;

NOW, THEREFORE, the Transylvania County Board of Commissioners in recognition of this event does hereby proclaim the week of May 18 - 24, 2025, as EMERGENCY MEDICAL SERVICES WEEK.

The 51st anniversary of EMS Week theme is EMS WEEK: We Care. For Everyone. The Transylvania County Board of Commissioners encourages the community to observe this week with appropriate programs, ceremonies, and activities in honor of the EMS profession and the essential service it provides.

This the 12th day of May 2025.

S://Jason R. Chappell, Chairman Transylvania County Board of Commissioners

RESOLUTION COMMEMORATING MEMORIAL DAY

The Board approved a resolution in observance of Memorial Day, May 26, 2025, to honor and remember the courageous men and women who gave their lives in service to the United States.

RESOLUTION #23-2025 COMMEMORATING MEMORIAL DAY 2025

WHEREAS, Americans have observed Memorial Day since May 1868 to honor the sacrifices of the brave men and women who gave their lives in defense of our great nation; and

WHEREAS, since that time, brave men and women have answered our nation's call to duty and defended freedom at home and abroad; and

WHEREAS, these men and women have served in the Army, Navy, Marine Corps, Coast Guard, Air Force and Merchant Marines with heroism, determination and valor; and

WHEREAS, many of those who faced enemy fire on the battlefields the world over were from Transylvania County; and

WHEREAS, Memorial Day is a special day when Americans rededicate themselves to the principles upon which our nation was founded, and men and women in the Armed Forces have died defending; and

WHEREAS, Memorial Day offers each of us the opportunity to honor loved ones and remind ourselves of the ideals that are the foundation of the freedoms we enjoy and endure because of the dedication and sacrifice of those who answered the nation's call;

NOW, **THEREFORE**, the Transylvania County Board of Commissioners hereby urges all citizens to join us in honoring the men and women who died in service to our nation in war to preserve our freedom and honor those families who endured the sorrow of a loved one making the ultimate sacrifice on behalf of the United States of America.

This the 12th day of May 2025.

S://Jason R. Chappell, Chairman Transylvania County Board of Commissioners

SOUTH MOUNTAINS 2025 REGIONAL HAZARD MITIGATION PLAN

The Board approved a resolution adopting the updated South Mountains 2025 Regional Hazard Mitigation Plan. This plan, required by FEMA and reviewed every five years, aims to reduce the impacts of future natural and manmade disasters. Emergency Management led the update process beginning in early 2024, incorporating public input and aligning with current objectives. The County's current plan is set to expire on July 20, 2025.

RESOLUTION # 24-2025 ADOPTING THE SOUTH MOUNTAINS REGIONAL HAZARD MITIGATION PLAN

WHEREAS, the citizens and property within Transylvania County are subject to the effects of natural hazards that pose threats to lives and cause damage to property, and with the knowledge and experience that certain areas of the county are particularly vulnerable to drought, extreme heat, hailstorm, hurricane and tropical storm, lightning, thunderstorm wind/high wind, tornado, winter storm and freeze, flood, hazardous material incident, and wildfire; and

WHEREAS, Transylvania County desires to seek ways to mitigate the impact of identified hazard risks; and

WHEREAS, the Legislature of the State of North Carolina has in Article 5, Section 160D-501 of Chapter 160D of the North Carolina General Statutes, delegated to local governmental units the responsibility to adopt regulations designed to promote the public health, safety, and general welfare of its citizenry; and

WHEREAS, the Legislature of the State of North Carolina has enacted General Statute Section 166A-19.41 (*State emergency assistance funds*) which provides that for a state of emergency declared pursuant to G.S. 166A-19.20(a) after the deadline established by the Federal Emergency Management Agency pursuant to the Disaster Mitigation Act of 2002, P.L. 106-390, the eligible entity shall have a hazard mitigation plan approved pursuant to the Stafford Act; and

WHEREAS, Section 322 of the Federal Disaster Mitigation Act of 2000 states that local governments must develop an All-Hazards Mitigation Plan in order to be eligible to receive future Hazard Mitigation Grant Program Funds and other disaster-related assistance funding and that said Plan must be updated and adopted within a five-year cycle; and

WHEREAS, the county has performed a comprehensive review and evaluation of each section of the previously approved Hazard Mitigation Plan and has updated the said plan as required under regulations at 44 CFR Part 201 and according to guidance issued by the Federal Emergency Management Agency and the North Carolina Division of Emergency Management; and

WHEREAS, it is the intent of the Board of Commissioners of Transylvania County to fulfill this obligation in order that the county will be eligible for federal and state assistance in the event that a state of disaster is declared for a hazard event affecting the County;

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved that the Board of Commissioners of Transylvania County hereby:

- 1. Adopts the South Mountains Regional Hazard Mitigation Plan.
- 2. Agrees to take such other official action as may be reasonably necessary to carry out the objectives of the Hazard Mitigation Plan.

Adopted this the 12th of May 2025.

S://Jason R. Chappell, Chairman Transylvania County Board of Commissioners

LETTER IN OPPOSITION TO HOUSE BILL 219 (COUNTIES/FRANCHISE AMBULANCE SERVICE) AND HOUSE BILL 675 (EMT PERSONNEL CREDENTIALING MODIFICATIONS)

The Board approved a letter opposing House Bill 219 (Counties/Franchise Ambulance Service) and House Bill 675 (EMT Personnel Credentialing Modifications), based on significant public health, operational, and financial concerns raised by Transylvania County Emergency Medical Services and the NC Association of EMS Administrators. The Board expressed strong opposition to the proposed legislation, which could reduce local control, compromise patient safety, and impose substantial credentialing burdens and costs on EMS personnel and agencies across the state.

PRESENTATIONS/RECOGNITIONS

EMERGENCY RESPONSE UPDATE TO HURRICANE/TROPICAL STORM HELENE The Manager provided an update on the County's response and recovery efforts:

- FEMA Individual Assistance (as of May 6, 2025):
 - \$8M+ awarded to Transylvania County residents
 - 0 4,838 valid registrations; 3,030 applicants eligible for Housing or Other Needs Assistance
 - No households currently using FEMA Transitional Sheltering Assistance (TSA)
 - FEMA is offering eligible occupants the option to purchase temporary housing units (with conditions)
- Ongoing Resources and Deadlines:
 - The FEMA application period has closed
 - SBA Disaster Relief is available through June 6 for businesses, nonprofits, homeowners, and renters
 - WNC Economic Recovery resources available at wncrecovery@nc.gov/resources
 - o Private road/bridge damage assistance available at ncdps.gov/Helene/prb
- Housing Support and Debris Removal:
 - All eligible households have received rental support or a FEMA unit
 - Half of the qualified applicants chose to stay in damaged dwellings or use personal resources
 - USACE approved for:
 - Public right-of-way debris removal
 - Private property demolition/removal
 - Waterway debris removal
- Debris Removal Oversight & Communications:
 - USACE temporarily paused waterway debris removal for 96 hours to review best practices
 - All debris operations resumed as of May 7
 - Contractors are under USACE authority, not County control
 - Citizen and official concerns about environmental compliance have been forwarded to USACE/FEMA
 - Communication between County staff and USACE/FEMA has improved with weekly updates
 - The County submitted a list of remaining public right-of-way debris to USACE (coordinated with NCDOT)
 - Waterway debris removal is expected to be completed by June 1
 - o Private property debris removal moving through approval; approx. 400 applications anticipated
- Public Contact Info for Debris Concerns:
 - FEMA: FEMA-dr4827-NC-debris@FEMA.dhs.gov
 - NC Emergency Management: debris@ncdps.gov

The Manager concluded the update and invited comments and questions from the Board.

Commissioner McCall referenced a WLOS news report stating that 24 property owners in Transylvania County have expressed interest in selling their flood-affected properties. She asked for confirmation of the figures. The County Manager responded that the number was likely accurate and reflected a shift, as some property owners originally seeking buyouts have since opted to elevate their homes instead. Emergency Management Director Kevin Shook also indicated the figures were consistent with his understanding. The Manager noted the state is processing applications in phases and that figures are subject to change as property owners make decisions.

Chairman Chappell asked the Manager to request a final report on waterway debris removal prior to the program's expiration on June 1, including locations and quantities removed.

Commissioner McCall inquired about the future of flood-damaged properties sold to the County. The Manager explained that the acquired properties are deeded to the County, removed from the tax rolls, and subject to strict deed restrictions. These properties may only be used for limited purposes such as passive

parks, with some precedent for narrowly defined public uses (e.g., a publicly run campground), but such uses require state and FEMA approval.

Commissioner Chapman shared that he spoke with Marty Davis of the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers, who confirmed that river cleanup has resumed following a brief pause due to forecasted rainfall. USACE remains committed to completing the debris removal project.

Commissioner McCall asked whether debris cleanup was occurring on the Davidson River. The Manager clarified that work was underway on the Little River and the French Broad River, but not currently on the Davidson River.

CAPITAL WORKSHOP PREP

The Manager continued the capital workshop groundwork with a presentation focused on Blue Ridge Community College:

- Background:
 - Master Plan Study (Clark Nexsen) approved in FY 21; added \$32M to the capital plan
 - Board-appointed Advisory Committee met from April–October 2023 and issued a final report
 - Facility Condition Assessment (2021–2026):
 - Straus Building: 130/200 pts (B Rating); points loss due to energy efficiency \$421,315 in improvements
 - Applied Technology Building: 153/200 pts (A Rating); points loss due to energy efficiency \$148,220 in improvements
 - Parking & Landscaping: \$137,560
 - Total identified improvements: \$707,095
 - Clark Nexsen's study (2021) presented to the Board of Commissioners (2022) proposing three options:
 - Tear-down of Straus Building
 - New building using existing square footage of Applied Technology and Straus Buildings: gross square footage 40,668
 - New 54,577 sq. ft. building on existing site (\$35M)
- Enrollment Trends:
 - Enrollment has been growing since FY 22; now just above 300 FTE (state threshold)
 - o Over 150 dual enrollment students in FY 23
 - \circ ~20% of Transylvania graduates enroll at Blue Ridge
- Program Needs:
 - 15,000 sq. ft. of additional space needed
 - Identified needs: respiratory therapy, skilled trades (welding, electrical, HVAC, plumbing, masonry), life sciences, flex labs, office space, large meeting areas
 - Total space need: 77,958 sq. ft.
- Existing Site Challenges (identified by College):
 - Maintaining enrollment and meeting new program space needs
 - Straus Building near future roundabout right-of-way
 - Construction would reduce parking
 - Brevard UDO presents development challenges
 - No adjacent parcels are currently available for expansion
- New Campus Analysis:
 - College prefers a location on the east side of the County; site challenges due to floodplain and limited large parcels
 - Corridor analysis (US 64 between Rosman and Brevard):

- 13 parcels > 20 acres; 18 > 15 acres; 26 > 10 acres; 51 > 5 acres
- Total replacement cost: \$50.8M (excluding land, site work, infrastructure)
- Funding Considerations:
 - County revenue: property tax and sales tax (¹/₄ cent sales tax requires voter approval failed last fall)
 - Financing options:
 - Cash/pay-as-you-go
 - Bonds (GO requires referendum; LOB more upfront cash)
 - Private loans (up to 20 years)
 - State funding/grants
 - Property sale (subject to Trustees; tax value: \$5M)
 - Estimated $\frac{1}{4}$ cent sales tax = 1.5 M/year (covers ~15 M project over 20 years)
 - Property tax estimates:
 - 1 cent = \sim \$600K
 - \$35M project: 3.3¢ w/ sales tax; 5.7¢ w/o
 - \$50M project: 5.6¢ w/ sales tax; 8.1¢ w/o
- Committee Findings:
 - An additional 15,000 sq. ft. is needed for new programs
 - Missed opportunity to house trades program due to space limitations
 - The existing site is insufficient for future flexibility and is cost-prohibitive
 - Urgent need to plan for a new campus and coordinate with the Transylvania Economic Alliance
- Next Steps:
 - Community college buildings included in recent county facility assessments (draft stage)
 - Assessments will inform upcoming capital workshop discussions

The Manager concluded the presentation and invited comments from the Board.

Commissioner Chapman asked whether the advisory committee had identified a specific timeframe or "dropdead" date for deciding the college's capital needs. The Manager responded that while no official deadline was set, there was a clear sense of urgency from Blue Ridge Community College leadership. She noted that Dr. Leatherwood attended all the advisory committee meetings and expressed concern about the need to move the project forward to retain a viable campus presence in Transylvania County.

Commissioner Chapman commented that with the magnitude of a \$40–\$50 million investment, he did not see a feasible path forward without going to the public for a bond referendum. He stated that a project of this scale could not realistically be absorbed within the County's current tax structure and that public support would need to be assessed before proceeding.

Commissioner McCall voiced concern about pursuing a bond referendum without having first identified a suitable site for development. She added that unless a new campus could be located in the direction of Rosman or Lake Toxaway, particularly in the Cherryfield area, she questioned the value of the project. She was candid in her view that the closer a new campus is to the Henderson County line, the less need there is for Transylvania County to pursue it. She encouraged the County to examine alternatives, such as acquiring or leasing satellite properties that could host programs outside the main campus footprint.

When asking if there was a verified need for an additional 15,000 square feet, the Manager confirmed that the figure was based on programmatic needs identified by the College. Commissioner McCall further inquired whether that space could be added to the current campus. The Manager explained that staff indicated there was not enough room due to parking limitations and stormwater requirements, though a detailed exploration of that possibility had not occurred. Commissioner McCall emphasized the importance of exhausting every

potential option before pursuing what she described as the most expensive solution. She also expressed support for attempting the ¹/₄ cent sales tax referendum again in 2026, asserting that the previous failure may have been due to misunderstanding among voters. She clarified that this sales tax does not apply to groceries or gasoline and is largely supported by tourism dollars, potentially saving property owners up to two cents on the property tax rate.

Commissioner Chapman then inquired about state funding that has supported the community college system, particularly for buildings and upgrades. The Manager explained that while a past state bond helped fund a small addition, recurring capital expenses are the responsibility of the County. Commissioner Chapman emphasized the need for proactive communication with state legislators and ensuring they are informed about local needs and project costs. Chairman Chappell noted that legislators were already aware of the situation and that Dr. Leatherwood had shared the same information with them. He reminded Commissioners that this project would be discussed further during the capital workshop, where they would review additional details such as financing scenarios, tax rate impacts, and the results of the recent Axias facility assessments.

Commissioner McKelvey addressed the concerns raised by the advisory committee about the City of Brevard's Unified Development Ordinance (UDO), which the committee chose not to explore in depth. He argued that all options should be considered, especially given the scale of the proposed investment. He supported locating a new campus in a more central part of the County and expressed concern that pushing the campus toward the Henderson County line would undermine local access. He suggested that a location along the US 64 corridor between Brevard and Rosman would better serve the community, citing the fact that 20% of high school graduates currently attend Blue Ridge Community College. Commissioner McKelvey requested more information on the 18 parcels over 15 acres that had been identified as potentially suitable for development and encouraged staff to pursue due diligence to determine which properties, if any, could be acquired. He concluded by urging the County to find a solution that unites the community rather than moving essential services further from the population center.

The Manager explained that the committee did not pursue a UDO analysis because no site plan existed for evaluation. She noted that one of the primary concerns was stormwater management on the existing campus, which would require detailed engineering and site modeling to determine if additional construction was feasible.

There were no further comments or questions.

APPOINTMENTS

JOINT HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

The terms of Geralyn Connell, Andrew Wing, and Anne-Monique Ransdell expire at the end of May. All are eligible and willing to serve another term.

Commissioner McCall moved to reappoint Geralyn Connell and Anne-Monique Ransdell and appoint William Hunter to replace Andrew Wing, seconded by Commissioner Chapman. Commissioner McCall pointed out that Mr. Wing does not reside in Transylvania County and is not a registered voter, which does not meet the Board's citizen advisory council policy. She emphasized the importance of adhering to this eligibility requirement. The motion passed unanimously.

TRANSPORTATION ADVISORY COMMITTEE

The terms of Harold Paxton, Scott McCall, and Howard Granat expire at the end of May. Harold Paxton, though eligible, declined reappointment. Howard Granat has completed two full terms and is no longer eligible. While Scott McCall has served at least two full terms, the Planning and Community Development department recommended waiving term limits for his reappointment due to his valuable ongoing

contributions. He currently serves as the TAC Chair and participates in the Brevard Circulation Study Stakeholder Committee through the Land of Sky Regional Council.

Commissioner Chapman moved to waive the term limits and reappoint Scott McCall. Commissioner McKelvey seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

Commissioner McCall nominated and moved to appoint Tim Waldrop and Lisa Presnell to fill the remaining vacancies, seconded by Commissioner Dalton. With no further nominations, the motion carried unanimously.

WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT BOARD

Arleca Chapman Diehl's term representing the Community Based Organization category runs through the end of May. Nathan Ramsey, Director of the Mountain Area Workforce Development Board, recommended her reappointment, noting she currently serves as Vice-Chair and is an exemplary board member.

Commissioner Chapman moved to reappoint Arleca Chapman Diehl, seconded by Commissioner McKelvey and approved unanimously.

OLD BUSINESS

LANDFILL PHASE 7 BID

Assistant County Manager David McNeill reported that, since 2020, County staff have collaborated with LaBella Associates to permit and design the Phase 7 expansion of the County landfill. The initial construction bid was issued in late 2024, just prior to Hurricane Helene. Bids were due the Tuesday following the storm; however, only one bid was received. Due to procurement regulations, the County was unable to open the single bid and was required to rebid the project. Staff continued to work with LaBella Associates, and the project was rebid with a new deadline of November 6, 2024. Unfortunately, the County again received only one bid, which came in significantly higher than the budget estimate provided by LaBella. As a result, the bid was rejected.

LaBella Associates revised the Phase 7 project scope in an effort to reduce costs and bring the project closer to budget. Previous construction phase cost estimates from LaBella showed a significant escalation over time—from \$3,444,224 for 6.4 acres in February 2022 to \$5,539,792 for 6 acres in March 2024. The total project budget at that time was estimated at \$6,564,522. In 2023, with advocacy from the Board of Commissioners and County Manager, the North Carolina General Assembly approved a \$7 million grant intended to fully fund the landfill expansion, which was projected to extend landfill capacity by an additional five years.

Bids for the revised Phase 7 Landfill Expansion project were received on April 8, 2025, from four contractors. Following a detailed review by County staff and LaBella Associates, the lowest qualified bid was submitted by CBP Environmental for \$7,895,450.20.

This results in a total revised project cost of \$9,907,184, which exceeds the available \$7 million grant and budget. However, the funding gap has been partially reduced due to a portion of engineering and permitting expenses having already been covered through Fund 35 in previous fiscal years.

- Planning phase costs to date: \$429,255 (professional services and permitting)
- Construction-phase costs to date: \$197,234

Staff requested Board direction on how to proceed with the project given the \$2,477,929 funding shortfall. The projected construction timeline is eight to nine months, weather permitting.

The most recent compaction study indicates the current landfill cell will reach capacity between March and June 2026, highlighting the urgency of moving forward with the expansion to maintain operational continuity.

Expenses		Revenues	
Construction	\$8,163,462 (includes cell tower relocation, land clearing)	Grants	\$7 million
Professional Services/Permitting	\$953,523	Solid Waste Fund- Pre-Paid	\$429,255
Print Services	\$654	General Fund, Fund Balance Appropriation	\$2,477,929
Contingency	\$789,545		
Total Expenses	\$9,907,184	Total Revenues	\$9,907,184

Commissioner Chapman asked for clarification on the source of the additional funding needed for the Phase 7 landfill expansion. The Manager explained that the proposed solution is to allocate additional dollars from the general fund's fund balance. She reminded the Board that several years ago, it was acknowledged that the solid waste enterprise is not self-sustaining through its revenue and continues to be subsidized by the general fund. There are no available revenues within Fund 35 to cover the shortfall for this project, so a drawdown from the general fund would be required to proceed.

The Manager noted that another item on the agenda involves consideration of a study of future solid waste operations, which will evaluate both revenues and overall operations. The outcomes of that study will help inform the Board's decisions about the long-term direction of solid waste services in Transylvania County. She pointed out that the proposed study will be conducted by a different firm, which is relevant to the current discussion.

Chairman Chappell emphasized that this situation exemplifies how necessary services drive budget increases—not due to discretionary spending, but because the County is mandated or obligated to provide essential services like waste management. He stressed that this is not something the Board can opt out of.

Commissioner McCall added that although the cost of the landfill expansion is significant, it is important to recognize that \$7 million of the project is funded through a state grant, not property tax dollars. She also noted that the County receives various other grants and reimbursements that affect the budget in similar ways. She concurred that the project is essential and that failing to move forward would leave the County without a viable means to manage waste.

Chairman Chappell expressed appreciation for the advocacy efforts by the Board and staff, which led to the County receiving the \$7 million state grant. He explained that the County was able to respond quickly when legislators requested funding needs, thanks to staff having already done the groundwork on the project. He thanked the Manager and staff for their foresight and preparation.

Commissioner McCall inquired about the County's confidence in the low bidder, CBP Environmental. Mr. McNeill stated that two separate engineering firms with experience working with CBP Environmental

reported positively on the quality of their work. He expressed confidence in recommending the firm, noting that they plan to utilize local subcontractors, which would benefit the local economy.

Commissioner McCall also asked whether CBP Environmental typically completes projects within budget. Mr. McNeill shared that staff have already begun collaborating with the contractor to identify potential cost savings, including:

- Utilizing on-site soils for required landfill layers, potentially reducing significant material costs.
- Exploring other cost-saving opportunities through project collaboration.

However, such cost-saving measures cannot be confirmed or implemented until a contract is executed and the contractor has access to the site. The Manager added that any realized savings could be returned to the general fund at the project's conclusion.

Commissioner Chapman asked whether the new landfill cell would provide five to six years of capacity and whether the current site could accommodate additional cells. Mr. McNeill confirmed the projected lifespan and noted there is space for additional cells at the current site. However, future expansions could involve complex and costly issues such as stream impacts. He explained that the upcoming solid waste alternatives study would assess these site-specific limitations and help forecast the long-term costs of continued landfilling at the current location.

The Manager acknowledged that, had the cost estimates been at this level five years ago, she would not have recommended moving forward with this approach. She emphasized that the cost of constructing a five-year landfill cell at \$10 million equates to about \$2 million per year—just for construction—and does not account for ongoing operational expenses. If these figures had been available during the last planning cycle for solid waste, the recommendation would have been different.

Chairman Chappell concurred and added that the cost increase could, at least in part, be attributed to the broader economic impacts of Hurricane Helene. While certain revenue losses from disasters can be formally documented and reimbursed, he noted that the disruption in the bidding process and shifting timelines may have discouraged some contractors from submitting proposals, potentially raising costs. Though it is not quantifiable or reimbursable, he viewed this as a secondary economic consequence of the storm. He further commented that the community will face other indirect impacts—cultural, environmental, or economic—that may not fit standard disaster aid criteria but will nonetheless be felt.

Commissioner McCall moved to award the contract for Landfill Phase 7 to CBP Environmental, with the remaining \$2,477,929 in needed funding to come from the general fund's fund balance. Commissioner McKelvey seconded the motion. Commissioner Dalton commented that it would be helpful if the County's \$10 million state appropriation could be reallocated for capital needs, and Chairman Chappell agreed, emphasizing the importance of continuing to advocate for flexibility in how state funds are used. The motion passed unanimously.

NEW BUSINESS

APPROVAL OF CONTRACT FOR ROSMAN ELEMENTARY SCHOOL PLAYGROUND PROJECT

On March 11, 2024, the Board of Commissioners endorsed the Step 1 Investment Plan presented by the Education Capital Workgroup. Following this, County and School staff collaborated with Axias to scope individual projects, identifying those that could proceed independently without delaying other priorities. These projects, including the Rosman Elementary School playground, were given flexibility and autonomy by the Board of Education.

On May 28, 2024, the Board of Commissioners earmarked \$4.3 million from the Education Capital Fund to support selected facility improvements. Within this allocation, \$500,000 was designated for the Rosman Elementary School playground. Transylvania County Schools solicited bids for the project and recommended awarding the contract to Barr's Recreation for \$399,999.12. While bids for the RES preschool playground are still pending, staff anticipated they would fall between \$65,000 and \$75,000, potentially leaving savings in the overall project budget. Staff recommended approval of the contract with Barr's Recreation.

Commissioner Chapman asked whether the playground would be completed before the start of the new school year. From the audience, Superintendent Dr. Lisa Fletcher and Facilities Director Kerry Putnam confirmed that it would.

Commissioner McCall asked about accessibility needs, and Mr. Putnam explained that while all schools have accessibility challenges, this design incorporates accessible features.

Chairman Chappell asked whether Barr's Recreation had worked with the County or School System before. Mr. Putnam stated this would be the first project with Barr's for the schools, but the Manager noted that the County has previously worked with them.

Commissioner McKelvey moved to approve the contract with Barr's Recreation, seconded by Commissioner McCall. The motion passed unanimously.

Chairman Chappell thanked those involved for finding alternatives to stay within budget and said he looked forward to the completed project.

<u>REQUEST FOR ADDITIONAL FUNDING FOR BREVARD ELEMENTARY SCHOOL PLAYGROUND</u> <u>PROJECT</u>

The request for additional funding for the Brevard Elementary School playground project stems from the same background as the Rosman Elementary project. The Board earmarked \$300,000 for the Brevard Elementary playground.

Transylvania County Schools solicited bids for the project, all of which exceeded the allocated amount. With the assistance of County staff, Barr's Recreation reduced its proposal to \$354,218.92. However, the Board of Education recommended awarding the project to Blue Ridge Playgrounds, which submitted a bid of approximately \$361,000. Kompan also submitted a bid but at a significantly higher price of \$524,000.

During the April 21, 2025, Board of Education meeting, School System staff presented a detailed comparison and rationale for recommending Blue Ridge Playgrounds. Key points included:

- A cost of \$28.54 per square foot of surfacing in the Blue Ridge proposal.
- 4,200 more square feet of surface area included than in Barr's proposal.
- Inclusion of double-posted swings, which are sturdier than the single-post design offered by Barr's.
- When factoring in the additional surfacing, Barr's cost would have exceeded \$531,000.
- Multiple attempts by TCS staff to get an updated, accurate proposal from Barr's were unsuccessful, while Blue Ridge submitted a bid that met all specifications.

Superintendent Dr. Lisa Fletcher recommended that the Board of Education request an additional \$61,000 from the County's Education Capital Fund to move forward with the Blue Ridge proposal. The intent is to begin construction over the summer, and staff will continue to work with the vendor to find any feasible cost reductions.

Staff recommended that the Board of Commissioners consider the additional \$61,000 to support the project.

Commissioner Chapman inquired whether lottery funds could be used to cover the additional cost of the Brevard Elementary School playground project. The Manager responded that staff had not yet explored whether playgrounds are an eligible use of lottery funds but could research that option. However, she noted that the current proposed budget already designates lottery funds for a different project. If that project is not approved, there could be an opportunity to reallocate those funds. Even so, since the Education Capital Fund budgets revenues by project, any shift in funding would still require moving those revenues within the fund.

Commissioner McKelvey questioned why the Blue Ridge Playgrounds proposal included 4,200 more square feet of surfacing than Barr's. The Manager said she did not have a definitive answer but explained that the additional surface area stems from each vendor's independent assessment and recommendation of what they believed was necessary for the site. Since the surface material is a poured product, vendors may have used different assumptions in calculating the required area.

Chairman Chappell asked whether the School System had previously worked with Blue Ridge Playgrounds. Mr. Putnam confirmed that the School System had used the vendor on prior projects and was satisfied with the product and performance. He also clarified that multiple playground areas exist at Brevard Elementary School. While initial drawings illustrated appropriate square footage, the most recent submission from Barr's reduced that figure. Despite multiple requests, Barr's did not submit a revised bid.

Commissioner McKelvey inquired about whether the project would resolve drainage issues at the site. Mr. Putnam responded that the current playground project will not address drainage, but a separate plan is in place to address the drainage coming from the top slope of the hill during the summer.

Commissioner McCall noted the importance of accessibility, especially since Brevard Elementary has selfcontained classrooms for students with severe physical and medical needs. She asked whether the planned playground would be accessible for all students. Mr. Putnam assured the Board that accessibility is a primary focus of the project. He credited Principal Kirst for seeking input from the PTO and teachers to ensure the design met those needs. He emphasized that much of the project's cost is attributed to accessibility features, particularly the pour-in-place surfacing that allows access for students with mobility challenges. The square footage is directly tied to meeting accessibility standards. The Manager added that the pour-in-place surface not only improves safety but also reduces long-term maintenance costs, making it a more sustainable investment over time.

Commissioner McKelvey sought confirmation that Barr's Recreation had received the same specifications and bid requirements as the other vendors but still submitted a proposal with a smaller surface area. Mr. Putnam confirmed that Barr's had been provided with specific and detailed information and should have had all the necessary data to submit a fully compliant bid.

Commissioner McKelvey noted that while Barr's bid was only \$7,000 less than Blue Ridge Playgrounds', it was not truly comparable, as it was short by approximately 4,200 sq. ft. Mr. Putnam confirmed this and explained that school staff had gone back to Barr's three times to request revisions. The initial bid was too low to be comparable, and clear instructions were provided for the third request. Upon detailed review of the final submission, staff determined that the proposed square footage was still lacking by about 4,200 sq. ft.

Commissioner McKelvey asked whether the Brevard Elementary School playground project could be completed before the start of the new school year. Mr. Putnam responded that assuming the Board approved the request, the project could be completed on time.

The Manager reminded the Board that the decision before them was to amend the project budget to allow the work to move forward. The actual contract approval will appear on the agenda at the next Board meeting.

Commissioner Chapman asked whether the Manager anticipated any additional major capital requests from the Education Capital Fund soon. The Manager replied that the next agenda item would involve drawing down funds, and another project would be brought before the Board of Education the following week related to the HVAC systems. She explained that the Schools Finance Director had been working through the purchase orders for the HVAC work previously funded by the Board of Commissioners, and an additional \$200,000 would be needed to complete those contracts. That funding request would be brought to the Board later. She also noted that as the County moves into the next budget cycle, all education projects exceeding \$50,000 will be routed through the Education Capital Fund.

Commissioner McCall expressed appreciation for the School System bringing forward the request but emphasized the importance of exploring all internal funding options first. She requested that future funding requests be accompanied by confirmation that other potential funding sources, including the School System's fund balance, have been evaluated—especially with more capital needs on the horizon.

The Manager acknowledged that the Superintendent had mentioned the possibility of applying savings from other projects to this one but added that those figures were not yet certain. She therefore did not recommend adjusting the project budget at this time.

Commissioner McCall moved to approve the funding request, with the added condition that future requests include confirmation that all potential internal funding sources have been fully evaluated. Commissioner Chapman seconded the motion, and it was unanimously approved.

Approval of the contract will be placed on the agenda for the next meeting.

REQUEST FOR FUNDING TO REPAIR RETAINING WALL AT ROSMAN HIGH SCHOOL

As part of the Step 1 approval process, Axias identified concerns about a retaining wall at Rosman High School. The Board of Commissioners previously approved \$50,000 to conduct a structural engineering analysis of the wall. Using those funds, Transylvania County Schools staff hired an engineer who presented three repair options. The Board of Education recommended proceeding with Option C, though a final budget for repairs had not yet been established until the preliminary engineering report was completed.

The County Manager and Superintendent consulted with the architects responsible for the larger scope of work at Rosman High and Rosman Middle Schools. They confirmed that the retaining wall project can proceed independently without impacting the larger projects.

Transylvania County Schools plans to manage the retaining wall repair project internally; therefore, the new project manager will not be assigned. The School System will oversee all bidding processes and must return the construction contract to the Board of Commissioners for approval. Invoices will be approved by School System staff and submitted to County Finance for payment processing directly to the vendor.

The Manager recommended allocating \$652,780 from the Education Capital Fund to establish a project budget for repairing the retaining wall at Rosman High School.

Regarding the bidding timeline, the Manager explained the statutory requirement of 90 days for the bid process. However, the School System intends to wait until next summer or mid-school year to begin construction. Allocating the budget now will allow the project to proceed when ready.

Chairman Chappell inquired about immediate safety risks. Facilities Director Kerry Putnam indicated the engineers do not consider the situation an immediate danger but acknowledged it still requires timely attention. He clarified that most of the existing wall will be removed, except for a small section near the cafeteria and the chiller.

Commissioner McCall moved to allocate \$652,780 from the Education Capital Fund for the retaining wall repair at Rosman High School, seconded by Commissioner Dalton. The motion was unanimously approved.

SOLID WASTE DISPOSAL OPTIONS ASSESSMENT AND RATE STUDY

Assistant County Manager David McNeill provided an update on the status and future planning for Solid Waste services. Transylvania County currently operates Solid Waste as an enterprise fund, but it has required transfers from the General Fund to support operational and capital needs.

With the rising cost of solid waste management, staff have been collaborating with Smith and Gardner Engineering to explore long-term options for solid waste management and associated funding strategies.

Smith and Gardner Engineering proposed two separate but related studies:

- 1. Solid Waste Rate Study Evaluate current fees to determine whether they cover system operations, capital needs (present and future), equipment, and post-closure requirements. Cost: \$67,800
- Long-Term Solid Waste Disposal Alternatives Study Assess various options, including continued landfilling, use of transfer stations, and incineration. The study will evaluate feasibility, costs, regulatory implications, and operational factors. Cost: \$56,600

Mr. McNeill proposed covering the total cost of the study (\$124,400) with \$85,000 carried over from FY 2024 (from landfill project savings) and \$39,400 from FY 2025 engineering funds.

Chairman Chappell emphasized the need to examine all options, given the long-term taxpayer impact. He confirmed that the study would include an evaluation of additional landfill cells at the existing site, as well as comparisons to other potentially viable locations.

Commissioner McCall asked about the timeline. Mr. McNeill stated the results are expected by the end of the calendar year. Given that the current cell will be full between March and June, and the next cell will last five years, long-term planning must begin now to accommodate the lengthy permitting and construction timeline.

Mr. McNeill stressed that each option reviewed will come with a corresponding rate schedule and funding mechanism to support enterprise fund sustainability.

Chairman Chappell confirmed with Mr. McNeill that the goal is to enable the Solid Waste Fund to operate as a true enterprise fund, no longer reliant on general fund transfers.

Commissioner McCall moved to approve the proposed studies, seconded by Commissioner McKelvey, and unanimously approved.

MANAGER'S REPORT

The Manager provided the following updates to the Board:

• The area is under a severe weather alert through Tuesday due to potential flooding. While impacts are not expected to match those of Hurricane Helene, residents in flood-prone areas or near

unstable landslide sites are encouraged to remain alert and prepared in case of shifting conditions due to rainfall.

- Transylvania County Transportation has been named Transit System of the Year by the North Carolina Public Transportation Association. The Manager offered congratulations to the team and shared that the Planning and Transportation Department will be invited to a future meeting to be formally recognized.
- Beecher Allison will begin as the County's new Project Manager on May 18. He has experience in construction management, including education-related projects. Under the interlocal agreement, he will provide monthly updates to both the Board of Commissioners and the Board of Education. The Manager will introduce him publicly at a future meeting.
- The next regular Board of Commissioners meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, May 27 at 6:00 p.m., due to the Memorial Day holiday on Monday, May 26. At that meeting, the Manager will present the recommended FY 2026 budget, and budget workshops are expected to follow the week after.
- In honor of Historic Preservation Month, the Joint Historic Preservation Commission will host a special program titled "*The Impact of the French Broad River in History*" featuring David Whitmire of Headwaters Outfitters. The event will be held on May 13 at 4:00 p.m. at the Champion Park Pavilion at Rosman Town Hall.
- Angie Gilespie was recognized as the 2025 Social Worker of the Year by the Foster Care Alliance. This statewide honor is based on nominations submitted by foster families. The Manager extended her congratulations on this significant achievement.
- As of May 6, canines at the Animal Shelter are under quarantine for two weeks due to an outbreak of canine distemper and influenza. During this time, no canine adoptions or surrenders will be allowed. Staff continue to care for the animals during the quarantine period.

PUBLIC COMMENT

The comments represent the speakers' opinions or points of view.

Sam Stites: Mr. Stites, representing the Living Wage Coalition of Transylvania County, addressed the Board to advocate for increasing wages for public employees, particularly school staff. He noted the Coalition's success working with the City of Brevard and encouraged Transylvania County to raise the wage floor for its employees in response to rising living costs. Mr. Stites specifically called on the Board to support the Board of Education's request to raise the local supplement for school staff to 9.5%, emphasizing that many educators, bus drivers, cafeteria workers, and custodians are struggling financially. He praised Transylvania County's recognition as ranking #2 in North Carolina for best teachers, as shared in a recent presentation by Superintendent Dr. Fletcher, and said this distinction reflects the dedication of local educators. He shared that the Living Wage Coalition is conducting a "state of work" survey among low-wage workers in the County and that nine of the respondents were educators-all of whom cited low wages and the high cost of living as their primary challenges. Mr. Stites urged the Board to support school staff by increasing their supplement and noted that the Coalition has published an open letter on its Facebook page and that of the Transylvania County Association of Educators, which individuals and organizations can sign to show support. He left a printed copy of the letter with a OR code for public access. He stated that raising wages is a clear and actionable step toward supporting a thriving community and demonstrating the County's commitment to its educators and public workforce.

COMMISSIONERS' COMMENTS

Commissioner Chapman acknowledged the numerous needs presented to the Board, emphasizing that these are real needs, not merely wants or aspirational projects. He noted that in many cases, the Board has little

choice but to act, and that challenging financial decisions lie ahead. Commissioner Chapman urged the community to share their priorities with the Board so they can respond accordingly while reminding everyone that all funding decisions are made using taxpayer dollars and that the Board has limited flexibility. He also encouraged the public to attend the upcoming Memorial Day ceremony on Monday at 11:00 a.m., where Mayor Maureen Copelof will serve as the guest speaker. He invited everyone to join in honoring veterans who made the ultimate sacrifice.

Chairman Chappell congratulated all those who contributed to the Sylvan Valley Industrial Center Phase II expansion, noting that the official dedication was held recently. He emphasized that this project represents a significant investment in the county's future and will pay dividends for years to come.

Chairman Chappell moved to enter into a closed session per N.C.G.S. § 143-318.11 (a) (3) To consult with an attorney employed or retained by the public body in order to preserve the attorney-client privilege between the attorney and the public body, which privilege is hereby acknowledged, and per N.C.G.S. § 143-318.11 (a) (4) To discuss matters relating to the location or expansion of industries or other businesses in the area served by the public body, after a 10-minute recess, seconded by Commissioner Dalton and unanimously approved.

CLOSED SESSION

Per N.C.G.S. § 143-318.11 (a) (3) To consult with an attorney employed or retained by the public body in order to preserve the attorney-client privilege between the attorney and the public body, which privilege is hereby acknowledged, and per N.C.G.S. § 143-318.11 (a) (4) To discuss matters relating to the location or expansion of industries or other businesses in the area served by the public body, a closed session was entered into at 5:50 p.m. Present were Chairman Chappell, Commissioners Chapman, Dalton, McCall, and McKelvey, County Manager Jaime Laughter, Transylvania Economic Alliance Executive Director Burton Hodges and Interim Chair Brian Traylor, Parker Poe Attorney Catherine Clodfelter IT Director Nathanael Carver for IT support, and Clerk to the Board Trisha Hogan. County Attorney Bill Bulfer participated remotely via Zoom meeting software.

The Board of Commissioners consulted with attorneys on a privileged and confidential matter.

Chairman Chappell moved to leave the closed session, seconded by Commissioner Dalton, and unanimously carried.

OPEN SESSION

Chairman Chappell moved to seal the minutes of the closed session until such time that opening the minutes does not frustrate the purpose of the closed session, seconded by Commissioner Dalton and unanimously approved.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Board, Chairman Chappell moved to adjourn the meeting at 8:07 p.m., seconded by Commissioner McCall and unanimously approved.

ATTEST:

Jason R. Chappell, Chairman Transylvania County Board of Commissioners Trisha M. Hogan, Clerk to the Board